

ANNUAL IMPLEMENTATION REPORT

2019

for the

INTERREG-IPA Bulgaria - Turkey CBC Programme

CCI No2014TC16I5CB005

Implementation Report for IPA II Cross-Border

PART A

IDENTIFICATION OF THE ANNUAL IMPLEMENTATION REPORT

CCI	2014TC1615CB005
Title	IPA II Cross-border Cooperation Programme Bulgaria-Turkey
Version	2019.0
Date of approval of the report by the monitoring committee	

IDENTIFICATION OF THE ANNUAL IMPLEMENTATION REPORT.....	2
KEY INFORMATION ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME FOR THE YEAR CONCERNED, INCLUDING ON FINANCIAL INSTRUMENTS, WITH RELATION TO THE FINANCIAL AND INDICATOR DATA.	5
3. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PRIORITY AXIS	7
3.1 OVERVIEW OF THE IMPLEMENTATION	7
3.2 COMMON AND PROGRAMME SPECIFIC INDICATORS (ARTICLE 50(2) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)	9
PRIORITY AXES OTHER THAN TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	9
TABLE 2: COMMON AND PROGRAMME SPECIFIC OUTPUT INDICATORS - 1.B.....	9
TABLE 1: RESULT INDICATORS - 1.B.1.1	10
TABLE 1: RESULT INDICATORS - 1.B.1.2	11
TABLE 2: COMMON AND PROGRAMME SPECIFIC OUTPUT INDICATORS - 2.D	12
TABLE 1: RESULT INDICATORS - 2.D.2.1	13
TABLE 1: RESULT INDICATORS - 2.D.2.2	14
TABLE 1: RESULT INDICATORS - 2.D.2.3	14
PRIORITY AXES FOR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE.....	15
TABLE 2: COMMON AND PROGRAMME SPECIFIC OUTPUT INDICATORS - 3. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	15
3.3 TABLE 3: INFORMATION ON THE MILESTONES AND TARGETS DEFINED IN THE PERFORMANCE FRAMEWORK.....	16
3.4. FINANCIAL DATA	18
TABLE 4: FINANCIAL INFORMATION AT PRIORITY AXIS AND PROGRAMME LEVEL.....	18
AS SET OUT IN TABLE 1 OF ANNEX II TO COMMISSION IMPLEMENTING REGULATION (EU) NO 1011/2014 (MODEL FOR TRANSMISSION OF FINANCIAL DATA) AND TABLE 17 OF MODEL FOR COOPERATION PROGRAMMES UNDER IPA.....	18
WHERE APPLICABLE, THE USE OF ANY CONTRIBUTION FROM THIRD COUNTRIES PARTICIPATING IN THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME SHOULD BE PROVIDED (FOR EXAMPLE IPA AND ENI, NORWAY, SWITZERLAND)	18
TABLE 6: CUMULATIVE COST OF ALL OR PART OF AN OPERATION IMPLEMENTED OUTSIDE THE UNION PART OF THE PROGRAMME AREA	18
4. SYNTHESIS OF THE EVALUATIONS	19
5. ISSUES AFFECTING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROGRAMME AND MEASURES TAKEN.....	25
(A) ISSUES WHICH AFFECT THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROGRAMME AND THE MEASURES TAKEN	25
(B) OPTIONAL FOR LIGHT REPORTS, OTHERWISE IT WILL BE INCLUDED IN POINT 9.1. AN ASSESSMENT OF WHETHER PROGRESS MADE TOWARDS TARGETS IS SUFFICIENT TO ENSURE THEIR FULFILMENT, INDICATING ANY REMEDIAL ACTIONS TAKEN OR PLANNED, WHERE APPROPRIATE.	25
6. CITIZEN'S SUMMARY (ARTICLE 50(9) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013).....	25
7. REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF FINANCIAL INSTRUMENTS (ARTICLE 46 OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013).....	25
8. PROGRESS IN PREPARATION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF MAJOR PROJECTS AND JOINT ACTION PLANS (ARTICLE 101(H) AND ARTICLE 111(3) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(3)(B) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013)	26
8.1. MAJOR PROJECTS.....	26
TABLE 7: MAJOR PROJECTS.....	26
SIGNIFICANT PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED IN IMPLEMENTING MAJOR PROJECTS AND MEASURES TAKEN TO OVERCOME THEM.....	26
ANY CHANGE PLANNED IN THE LIST OF MAJOR PROJECTS IN THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME	26
8.2. JOINT ACTION PLANS.....	26
TABLE 8: JOINT ACTION PLANS (JAP)	26
SIGNIFICANT PROBLEMS ENCOUNTERED AND MEASURES TAKEN TO OVERCOME THEM	27
9. ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 50(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013)	27
9.1 INFORMATION IN PART A AND ACHIEVING THE OBJECTIVES OF THE PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 50(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)	27
9.2. SPECIFIC ACTIONS TAKEN TO PROMOTE EQUALITY BETWEEN MEN AND WOMEN AND TO PROMOTE NON-DISCRIMINATION, IN PARTICULAR ACCESSIBILITY FOR PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES, AND THE ARRANGEMENTS IMPLEMENTED TO ENSURE THE INTEGRATION OF THE GENDER PERSPECTIVE IN THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME AND OPERATIONS (ARTICLE 50(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(4), SUBPARAGRAPH 2, (D) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013)	27

9.3. SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT (ARTICLE 50(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(4), SUBPARAGRAPH 2, (E) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013).....	27
9.4. REPORTING ON SUPPORT USED FOR CLIMATE CHANGE OBJECTIVES (ARTICLE 50(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013).....	28
9.5. ROLE OF PARTNERS IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 50(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(4), SUBPARAGRAPH 1, (C) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013).....	28
10. OBLIGATORY INFORMATION AND ASSESSMENT ACCORDING TO ARTICLE 14(4), SUBPARAGRAPH 1 (A) AND (B), OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013.....	28
10.1. PROGRESS IN IMPLEMENTATION OF THE EVALUATION PLAN AND THE FOLLOW-UP GIVEN TO THE FINDINGS OF EVALUATIONS.....	28
10.2. THE RESULTS OF THE INFORMATION AND PUBLICITY MEASURES OF THE FUNDS CARRIED OUT UNDER THE COMMUNICATION STRATEGY.....	30
11. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION WHICH MAY BE ADDED DEPENDING ON THE CONTENT AND OBJECTIVES OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 14(4), SUBPARAGRAPH 2 (A), (B), (C) AND (F), OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013).....	30
11.1. PROGRESS IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTEGRATED APPROACH TO TERRITORIAL DEVELOPMENT, INCLUDING INTEGRATED TERRITORIAL INVESTMENTS, SUSTAINABLE URBAN DEVELOPMENT, AND COMMUNITY LED LOCAL DEVELOPMENT UNDER THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME.....	30
11.2. PROGRESS IN IMPLEMENTATION OF ACTIONS TO REINFORCE THE CAPACITY OF AUTHORITIES AND BENEFICIARIES TO ADMINISTER AND TO USE THE IPA.....	30
11.3. CONTRIBUTION TO MACRO-REGIONAL AND SEA BASIN STRATEGIES (WHERE APPROPRIATE).....	31
11.4. PROGRESS IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ACTIONS IN THE FIELD OF SOCIAL INNOVATION.....	32
13. SMART, SUSTAINABLE AND INCLUSIVE GROWTH.....	32
14. ISSUES AFFECTING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROGRAMME AND MEASURES TAKEN — PERFORMANCE FRAMEWORK (ARTICLE 50(2) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013).....	32
DOCUMENTS.....	33
LATEST VALIDATION RESULTS.....	33

2. OVERVIEW OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME (Article 50(2) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 and Article 14(3)(a) of Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013)

Key information on the implementation of the cooperation programme for the year concerned, including on financial instruments, with relation to the financial and indicator data.

By the end of 2019 a total of 42 projects, financed under the 1st Call for proposals of the INTERREG-IPA Cross-border Cooperation Programme Bulgaria – Turkey (the Programme) were finalized. The total verified amount until the end of 2019 for the projects is EUR 8 963 956 (30,24% from the contracted budget).

After Joint Monitoring Committee meeting (JMC) in the end of 2018 when projects under the 2nd Call for proposals were provisionally approved for financing, in 2019 pre-contracting procedures with all projects provisionally approved for financing and included in the reserve list were conducted (check for double financing, check for compliance with state aid rules, site visits and budget optimization procedures of 71 project proposals). The Pre-contracting Report, was approved with JMC decision from 11.06.2019. For concluding the subsidy contracts were recommended 34 projects at the total amount of EUR 10 744 185,10 as follows:

- PA 1 "Environment"- 19 projects at the total amount of EUR 5 113 268,97;
- PA 2 "Sustainable Tourism" - 15 projects at the total amount of EUR 5 630 916,13.

The official ceremony for awarding of the subsidy contracts under the Second Call for proposals was held on 23 July 2019 at premises of MRDPW in Sofia, Bulgaria. The event was attended by the Deputy Minister of Regional Development and Public Works of the Republic of Bulgaria and Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs & Director of EU Affairs of the Republic of Turkey.

In accordance with the decision of the JMC from 11.06.2019 the Managing Authority (MA) and the National Authority (NA) prepared financial analysis and proposal for the use of the remaining available funds with a view to the achievement of the Output indicators and the full absorption of funds under the Programme. The prepared financial analysis showed that there were substantial savings from the amount allocated towards the Second Call for Proposals (Programme allocations for the years 2018, 2019 and 2020 - EUR 15 650 351), as well as savings from finalized projects and not contracted amount from the First Call for proposals. The analysis of level of achievement of Programme output indicators with financed under the 1st and 2nd Call for Proposals projects showed that after revision of the quantities (and sources of verification) of the OIs of the project proposals approved for financing under 2nd Call for Proposal, the targets of all output indicators under PA1 will be achieved. For PA2 the analysis of level of achievement of Programme output indicators shows that target of one of the output indicators under PA2 could still not be achieved (OI 2.1.4 "Number of reconstructed / restored cultural and historical touristic sites"). Based on the above the JMC with decision from 30.09.2019 approve for financing additional 14 applications proposed under PA 2 "Sustainable Tourism" of total amount of EUR 3 273 423,42 (3 of them based on their contribution to specific output indicators). Under Priority Axis 1 all qualitative proposals (with score 65 points or above) were approved for financing and there are no project proposals included in the reserve list. Therefore no project proposals were proposed for contracting under PA1.

In addition the MA and the NA executed an in-depth analysis of the status of Programme implementation with a view to the need to ensure full absorption of the funds in advance, according to the N+3 rule. The analysis for each Priority axis comprised all possible sources: realized savings from completed projects from the First Call for Proposals, recoveries as a result of financial corrections imposed, optimizations following budget negotiations with the approved projects under the Second Call for Proposals, decision for financing of project proposals from the reserve list and

overcontracting. Based on the analyses which was presented on the JMC meeting held on 12.11.2019, the Joint Monitoring Committee took the decision 2 more project proposals of total amount of EUR 578 507,90 from the reserve list under Priority Axis 2 to be financed with the available funds. At the same meeting the JMC approved launching of procedure for amendment of the Programme document 2014-2020 in a view of budget reallocation of EUR 1 203 833 from Priority Axis 1 to Priority Axes 2 for financing of all 12 project proposals from the reserve lists under PA2 (after amendment enters in force). Based on decision from Bulgarian Council of Ministers the revised Programme will be submitted to the European Commission for approval. The JMC took a decision the remaining available funds under Priority Axis 1 to be targeted for financing of strategic project with predefined main beneficiaries University Asen Zlatarov, Burgas and Trakya University of Edirne. The main objective of the strategic project will be to improve the capacity and the expertise in the field of maritime and environmental protection in the cross-border region while establishing sufficient facilities and infrastructure for applied scientific studies and joint coordinated activities. The Managing Authority and National Authority of the Programme were given a mandate to prepare and present for approval Guidelines for pre-defined applicants.

By the end of year 2019, 38 contracts under the 2nd Call for proposals of the Programme of total amount of EUR 11 589 579,44 were signed. With signed subsidy contracts in 2019 total 80,90 % of the Programme budget for Priority Axis (PA) 1 “Environment” and PA 2 “Sustainable tourism” is contracted.

In 2019 started the process of programming for future CBC Programme for 2021-2027 period. The Regional consultation aiming at raising awareness on the programming process were held in Burgas on 23.10.2019. In Edirne was organized 2 focus groups (on 29.07.2019 and 30.07.2019) and in Kirklareli 4 focus groups discussion were conducted (on 31.07.2019 and 01.08.2019). About 100 representatives of local and regional authorities, branch organizations, educational institutions, non-governmental organizations from cross-border regions took place in the events. Questionnaires with comments/recommendations from local shareholders related to preparation of the future programme, were filled in and summarized. Another activity was related with nomination and establishment of Joint Working Group (JWG) for preparation of the future CBC Programme 2021-2027. The first meeting of JWG was held on 12.11.2019 in Edirne, Turkey. On the meeting Rule of procedures of JWG and Concept Paper were adopted and the next steps of programming 2021-2027 were discussed. The implementation of the service contract for Implementation evaluation under Interreg - IPA CBC Programmes, managed by the Republic of Bulgaria, had been completed in March 2019. The final report includes information about the current programme progress and provides recommendations for further improvement of the overall management and implementation which could contribute towards successful achievement of objectives, results and outputs.

3. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PRIORITY AXIS

3.1 Overview of the implementation

ID	Priority axis	Key information on the implementation of the priority axis with reference to key developments, significant problems and steps taken to address these problems
1	Environment	<p>In 2019 under the Second Call for Proposals 17 projects at the total amount of EUR 4 661 397,92 were contracted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Under SO 1.1 “Preventing and mitigating the consequences of natural and man-made disasters in the cross-border area” - 3 projects at a total amount EUR 1 748 036,64 were under implementation (3 investment project with duration between 18 and 24 months). • Under SO 1.2 “Improving the capacity for nature protection, sustainable use and management of common natural resources through cooperation initiatives in the cross-border area” - 14 projects at a total amount EUR 2 913 351,28 were under implementation (8 soft projects with duration between 12 and 15 months and 6 investment projects with duration between 15 and 24 months). <p>No significant changes were requested by the beneficiaries under Specific Objective 1.1 and 1.2. By the end of 2019, seven projects (1 soft and 6 investment with duration between 12 and 24 months) at a total amount EUR 3 430 117,56 under SO 1.1 and nine projects (5 soft and 4 investment with duration between 12 and 24 months) at a total amount EUR 2 007 406,99 under SO 1.2, financed under the First Call for Proposals, were successfully completed and contributed to the Programme objectives. The targets of all 4 OIs under SO 1.1 are achieved by the end of the implementation period of the respective projects under the 1st Call for proposals. For SO 1.2 the targets for 3 out of 5 OIs are achieved by the end of the implementation period of the respective projects. No significant problems were detected in 2019.</p>
2	Sustainable tourism	<p>In 2019 under the Second Call for Proposals 21 projects at the total amount of EUR 6 928 191,52 were contracted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Under SO 2.1 “Increasing the touristic attractiveness of the cross-border area through better utilisation of natural, cultural and historical heritage and related infrastructure” - 13 investment projects at a total amount EUR 6 195 366,00 with duration between 18 and 24 months. • Under SO 2.2 “Increasing the cross-border tourism potential by developing common destinations” - 1 soft project at a total amount EUR 84 774,00 with duration 12 months. • Under SO 2.3 “Increasing networking for development of sustainable tourism through cross-border cooperation initiatives” - 7 soft projects at a total amount EUR 648 051,42 with duration 12 - 15 months. <p>No significant changes were requested by the beneficiaries under Specific Objective 2.1, 2.2 and 2.3. By the end of 2019, 9 investment projects (with duration between 15 and 24 months) at a total amount EUR 2 704 663,36 under SO 2.1, ten soft projects (with duration between 12 and 15 months) at a total amount EUR 921 048,97 under SO 2.2 and ten soft projects (with duration between 12 and 15 months) at a total amount EUR 842 843,29 under SO 2.3, financed under the First Call for Proposals, were</p>

ID	Priority axis	Key information on the implementation of the priority axis with reference to key developments, significant problems and steps taken to address these problems
		<p>successfully completed and contributed to the Programme objectives. The targets of 4 out of 5 OIs under SO 2.2 and 2 out of 3 OIs under SO 2.3 are achieved by the end of the implementation period of the respective projects under the 1st Call for proposals.</p> <p>No significant problems were detected in 2019.</p>
3	Technical assistance	<p>The Technical Assistance budget for year 2019 amounted to EUR 613 815.</p> <p>During the reporting period, Programme management activities were performed that ensured the necessary support related to projects implementation and administrative and operational activities concerning MA, NA, JS and FLC unit within the MA (staff remuneration, participation in various events and training seminars, maintenance of office premises, etc.).</p> <p>The Programme activities also include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of JMC meeting; • Organization of technical meeting of Programme bodies; • Pre-contracting procedures under 2nd Call; • The official ceremony for awarding of the subsidy contracts under the Second Call for proposals; • Trainings for team members of projects funded under the Second call; • Regional consultations and focus groups aiming at raising awareness on the programming process; • Service contract for socio-economic analysis of CBC area in Turkey for 2021-2027 Programming; • Meeting of Joint Working Group (JWG) for preparation of the future CBC Programme 2021-2027; • Finalizing of implementation of the Service contract for Implementation evaluation under Interreg - IPA CBC Programmes, managed by the Republic of Bulgaria (completed in March 2019); • Ongoing upgrading and maintenance of Programme official website and MIS; • Organization and participation in European Cooperation Day 2019 – conducted on 19 September 2018 in Haskovo, Bulgaria. <p>No significant problems were detected in year 2019.</p>

3.2 Common and programme specific indicators (Article 50(2) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

Priority axes other than technical assistance

Priority axis	1 - Environment
Thematic Priority	b - Protecting the environment and promoting climate change adaptation and mitigation, risk prevention and management through, inter alia: joint actions for environmental protection; promoting sustainable use of natural resources, resource efficiency, renewable energy sources and the shift towards a safe and sustainable low-carbon economy; promoting investment to address specific risks, ensuring disaster resilience and developing disaster management systems and emergency preparedness.

Table 2: Common and programme specific output indicators - 1.b

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2019	Observations
F	1.1.1	Number of interventions related to risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	number	3.00	8	
S	1.1.1	Number of interventions related to risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	number	3.00	13	
F	1.1.2	Number of joint strategies / common guidelines, trainings, public awareness campaigns, exchange of experience for risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	number	6.00	17	
S	1.1.2	Number of joint strategies / common guidelines, trainings, public awareness campaigns, exchange of experience for risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	number	6.00	28	
F	1.1.3	Population benefiting from flood protection measures	persons	290,000.00	402 749	
S	1.1.3	Population benefiting from flood protection measures	persons	290,000.00	530 374	
F	1.1.4	Population benefiting from forest fire protection measure	persons	480,000.00	675 662	
S	1.1.4	Population benefiting from forest fire protection measure	persons	480,000.00	809 251	
F	1.2.1	Number of nature protected areas addressed by interventions	number	5.00	12	
S	1.2.1	Number of nature protected areas addressed by interventions	number	5.00	21	
F	1.2.2	Number of capacity building / awareness activities related to nature protection, sustainable use and management of common natural resources	number	28.00	29	
S	1.2.2	Number of capacity building / awareness activities related to nature protection, sustainable use and management of common natural resources	number	28.00	60	
F	1.2.3	Number of people involved in training and capacity building activities in the field of nature protection	number	300.00	481	
S	1.2.3	Number of people involved in training and capacity building activities in the field of nature protection	number	300.00	970	
F	1.2.4	Number of joint initiatives addressing preservation of marine and coastal environment (incl. litter reduction)	number	5.00	0	
S	1.2.4	Number of joint initiatives addressing preservation of marine and coastal environment (incl. litter reduction)	number	5.00	7	
F	1.2.5	Number of joint management plans/ coordinated specific conservation activities for protected areas	number	3.00	1	
S	1.2.5	Number of joint management plans/ coordinated specific conservation activities for protected areas	number	3.00	13	

(1)	ID	Indicator	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
F	1.1.1	Number of interventions related to risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	2	0	0	0	0
S	1.1.1	Number of interventions related to risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	8	8	0	0	0

(I)	ID	Indicator	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
F	1.1.2	Number of joint strategies / common guidelines, trainings, public awareness campaigns, exchange of experience for risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	3	0	0	0	0
S	1.1.2	Number of joint strategies / common guidelines, trainings, public awareness campaigns, exchange of experience for risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	17	17	0	0	0
F	1.1.3	Population benefiting from flood protection measures	200 000	0	0	0	0
S	1.1.3	Population benefiting from flood protection measures	402 749	402 749	0	0	0
F	1.1.4	Population benefiting from forest fire protection measure	200 000	0	0	0	0
S	1.1.4	Population benefiting from forest fire protection measure	661 392	661 392	0	0	0
F	1.2.1	Number of nature protected areas addressed by interventions	10	0	0	0	0
S	1.2.1	Number of nature protected areas addressed by interventions	11	11	0	0	0
F	1.2.2	Number of capacity building / awareness activities related to nature protection, sustainable use and management of common natural resources	19	0	0	0	0
S	1.2.2	Number of capacity building / awareness activities related to nature protection, sustainable use and management of common natural resources	29	29	0	0	0
F	1.2.3	Number of people involved in training and capacity building activities in the field of nature protection	184	0	0	0	0
S	1.2.3	Number of people involved in training and capacity building activities in the field of nature protection	422	422	0	0	0
F	1.2.4	Number of joint initiatives addressing preservation of marine and coastal environment (incl. litter reduction)	0	0	0	0	0
S	1.2.4	Number of joint initiatives addressing preservation of marine and coastal environment (incl. litter reduction)	0	0	0	0	0
F	1.2.5	Number of joint management plans/ coordinated specific conservation activities for protected areas	1	0	0	0	0
S	1.2.5	Number of joint management plans/ coordinated specific conservation activities for protected areas	1	1	0	0	0

(1) S=Cumulative value - outputs to be delivered by selected operations [forecast provided by beneficiaries], F=Cumulative value - outputs delivered by operations [actual achievement]

Priority axis	1 - Environment
Thematic Priority	b - Protecting the environment and promoting climate change adaptation and mitigation, risk prevention and management through, inter alia: joint actions for environmental protection; promoting sustainable use of natural resources, resource efficiency, renewable energy sources and the shift towards a safe and sustainable low-carbon economy; promoting investment to address specific risks, ensuring disaster resilience and developing disaster management systems and emergency preparedness.
Specific objective	1.1 - Preventing and mitigating the consequences of natural and man-made disasters in the cross-border area

Table 1: Result indicators - 1.b.1.1

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2019 Total	2019 Qualitative	Observations
1.1	Increased level of preparedness to manage emergency situations in the cross-border area (qualitative target)	scale	2.24	2014	2.50		2.64	Frequency of reporting: 2018 2023

ID	Indicator	2018 Total	2018 Qualitative	2017 Total	2017 Qualitative	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative
1.1	Increased level of preparedness to manage emergency situations in the cross-border area (qualitative target)		2.64		0		0		0

ID	Indicator	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
1.1	Increased level of preparedness to manage emergency situations in the cross-border area (qualitative target)		0

Priority axis	1 - Environment
Thematic Priority	b - Protecting the environment and promoting climate change adaptation and mitigation, risk prevention and management through, inter alia: joint actions for environmental protection; promoting sustainable use of natural resources, resource efficiency, renewable energy sources and the shift towards a safe and sustainable low-carbon economy; promoting investment to address specific risks, ensuring disaster resilience and developing disaster management systems and emergency preparedness.
Specific objective	1.2 - Improving the capacity for nature protection, sustainable use and management of common natural resources through cooperation initiatives in the cross-border area

Table 1: Result indicators - 1.b.1.2

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2019 Total	2019 Qualitative	Observations
1.2	Increased capacity level for nature protection, sustainable use and management of common natural resources	scale	2.66	2014	3.00		2.82	Frequency of reporting: 2018 2023

ID	Indicator	2018 Total	2018 Qualitative	2017 Total	2017 Qualitative	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative
1.2	Increased capacity level for nature protection, sustainable use and management of common natural resources		2.82		0		0		0

ID	Indicator	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
1.2	Increased capacity level for nature protection, sustainable use and management of common natural resources		0

Priority axis	2 - Sustainable tourism
Thematic Priority	d - Encouraging tourism and cultural and natural heritage.

Table 2: Common and programme specific output indicators - 2.d

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2019	Observations
F	2.1.1	Total length of reconstructed or upgraded access roads to natural, cultural and historic tourism sites	kilometers	5.00	1,0272	
S	2.1.1	Total length of reconstructed or upgraded access roads to natural, cultural and historic tourism sites	kilometers	5.00	7,9160	
F	2.1.2	Total length of newly built, reconstructed or upgraded cycling routes / walking paths	kilometers	8.00	0,7460	
S	2.1.2	Total length of newly built, reconstructed or upgraded cycling routes / walking paths	kilometers	8.00	27,1910	
F	2.1.3	Number of newly built / reconstructed facilities in / leading to touristic sites	number	10.00	7	
S	2.1.3	Number of newly built / reconstructed facilities in / leading to touristic sites	number	10.00	17	
F	2.1.4	Number of reconstructed / restored cultural and historical touristic sites	number	15.00	2	
S	2.1.4	Number of reconstructed / restored cultural and historical touristic sites	number	15.00	13	
F	2.2.1	Number of sustainable tourism strategies/action plans of common tourist destinations	number	3.00	5	
S	2.2.1	Number of sustainable tourism strategies/action plans of common tourist destinations	number	3.00	5	
F	2.2.2	Number of marketing and promotional initiatives/events, addressing cross-border tourism products & services	number	13.00	19	
S	2.2.2	Number of marketing and promotional initiatives/events, addressing cross-border tourism products & services	number	13.00	21	
F	2.2.3	Number of tools developed and/or implemented for promotion of sustainable touristic potential	number	3.00	17	
S	2.2.3	Number of tools developed and/or implemented for promotion of sustainable touristic potential	number	3.00	17	
F	2.2.4	Number of trainings and consultancy services in sustainable use of natural, historical and cultural heritage and resources	number	3.00	7	
S	2.2.4	Number of trainings and consultancy services in sustainable use of natural, historical and cultural heritage and resources	number	3.00	8	
F	2.2.5	Number of people involved in training and capacity building activities in the field of sustainable tourism	number	200.00	184	
S	2.2.5	Number of people involved in training and capacity building activities in the field of sustainable tourism	number	200.00	210	
F	2.3.1	Number of networking events	number	15.00	20	
S	2.3.1	Number of networking events	number	15.00	32	
F	2.3.2	Number of public awareness initiatives promoting sustainable use of natural, historical and cultural heritage and resources	number	20.00	13	
S	2.3.2	Number of public awareness initiatives promoting sustainable use of natural, historical and cultural heritage and resources	number	20.00	26	
F	2.3.3	Number of public awareness initiatives promoting alternative forms of tourism	number	5.00	8	
S	2.3.3	Number of public awareness initiatives promoting alternative forms of tourism	number	5.00	11	

(1)	ID	Indicator	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
F	2.1.1	Total length of reconstructed or upgraded access roads to natural, cultural and historic tourism sites	0	0	0	0	0
S	2.1.1	Total length of reconstructed or upgraded access roads to natural, cultural and historic tourism sites	1,54	1,54	0	0	0
F	2.1.2	Total length of newly built, reconstructed or upgraded cycling routes / walking paths	0	0	0	0	0
S	2.1.2	Total length of newly built, reconstructed or upgraded cycling routes / walking paths	0,746	0,746	0	0	0
F	2.1.3	Number of newly built / reconstructed facilities in / leading to touristic sites	0	0	0	0	0
S	2.1.3	Number of newly built / reconstructed facilities in / leading to touristic sites	7	7	0	0	0
F	2.1.4	Number of reconstructed / restored cultural and historical touristic sites	0	0	0	0	0

(1)	ID	Indicator	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
S	2.1.4	Number of reconstructed / restored cultural and historical touristic sites	2	2	0	0	0
F	2.2.1	Number of sustainable tourism strategies/action plans of common tourist destinations	5	0	0	0	0
S	2.2.1	Number of sustainable tourism strategies/action plans of common tourist destinations	5	5	0	0	0
F	2.2.2	Number of marketing and promotional initiatives/events, addressing cross-border tourism products & services	19	0	0	0	0
S	2.2.2	Number of marketing and promotional initiatives/events, addressing cross-border tourism products & services	19	19	0	0	0
F	2.2.3	Number of tools developed and/or implemented for promotion of sustainable touristic potential	16	0	0	0	0
S	2.2.3	Number of tools developed and/or implemented for promotion of sustainable touristic potential	17	17	0	0	0
F	2.2.4	Number of trainings and consultancy services in sustainable use of natural, historical and cultural heritage and resources	4	0	0	0	0
S	2.2.4	Number of trainings and consultancy services in sustainable use of natural, historical and cultural heritage and resources	7	7	0	0	0
F	2.2.5	Number of people involved in training and capacity building activities in the field of sustainable tourism	120	0	0	0	0
S	2.2.5	Number of people involved in training and capacity building activities in the field of sustainable tourism	180	180	0	0	0
F	2.3.1	Number of networking events	15	0	0	0	0
S	2.3.1	Number of networking events	20	20	0	0	0
F	2.3.2	Number of public awareness initiatives promoting sustainable use of natural, historical and cultural heritage and resources	11	0	0	0	0
S	2.3.2	Number of public awareness initiatives promoting sustainable use of natural, historical and cultural heritage and resources	13	13	0	0	0
F	2.3.3	Number of public awareness initiatives promoting alternative forms of tourism	8	0	0	0	0
S	2.3.3	Number of public awareness initiatives promoting alternative forms of tourism	8	8	0	0	0

(1) S=Cumulative value - outputs to be delivered by selected operations [forecast provided by beneficiaries], F=Cumulative value - outputs delivered by operations [actual achievement]

Priority axis	2 - Sustainable tourism
Thematic Priority	d - Encouraging tourism and cultural and natural heritage.
Specific objective	2.1 - Increasing the touristic attractiveness of the cross-border area through better utilisation of natural, cultural and historical heritage and related infrastructure

Table 1: Result indicators - 2.d.2.1

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2019 Total	2019 Qualitative	Observations
2.1	Increased nights spent in the cross-border area	percentage	7,721,074.00	2014	1.00	10 308 550		Frequency of reporting: 2018 2023

ID	Indicator	2018 Total	2018 Qualitative	2017 Total	2017 Qualitative	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative
2.1	Increased nights spent in the cross-border area	10,308,550.00		0.00		0.00		0.00	

ID	Indicator	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
2.1	Increased nights spent in the cross-border area	0.00	

Priority axis	2 - Sustainable tourism
----------------------	--------------------------------

Thematic Priority	d - Encouraging tourism and cultural and natural heritage.
Specific objective	2.2 - Increasing the cross-border tourism potential by developing common destinations

Table 1: Result indicators - 2.d.2.2

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2019 Total	2019 Qualitative	Observations
2.2	Increased level of joint and integrated approaches to sustainable tourism development in the border area (qualitative target)	scale	2.50	2014	3.00		2.67	Frequency of reporting: 2018 2023

ID	Indicator	2018 Total	2018 Qualitative	2017 Total	2017 Qualitative	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative
2.2	Increased level of joint and integrated approaches to sustainable tourism development in the border area (qualitative target)		2.67		0		0		0

ID	Indicator	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
2.2	Increased level of joint and integrated approaches to sustainable tourism development in the border area (qualitative target)		0

Priority axis	2 - Sustainable tourism
Thematic Priority	d - Encouraging tourism and cultural and natural heritage.
Specific objective	2.3 - Increasing networking for development of sustainable tourism through cross-border cooperation initiatives

Table 1: Result indicators - 2.d.2.3

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value (2023) Total	2019 Total	2019 Qualitative	Observations
2.3	Increased level of awareness about sustainable tourism development in the cross-border area	scale	2.77	2014	3.50		2.99	Frequency of reporting: 2018 2023

ID	Indicator	2018 Total	2018 Qualitative	2017 Total	2017 Qualitative	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative
2.3	Increased level of awareness about sustainable tourism development in the cross-border area		2.99		0		0		0

ID	Indicator	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
2.3	Increased level of awareness about sustainable tourism development in the cross-border area		0

Priority axes for technical assistance

Priority axis	3 - Technical assistance
---------------	--------------------------

Table 2: Common and programme specific output indicators - 3.Technical assistance

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Target value	2019	Observations
F	3.1	No of performed evaluations of the programme	number	2	1	Not cumulative
S	3.1	No of performed evaluations of the programme	number	2	1	Not cumulative
F	3.2	Updated MIS system	number	1	1	Not cumulative
S	3.2	Updated MIS system	number	1	1	Not cumulative
F	3.3	No of Monitoring Committee meetings	number	14	1	Not cumulative
S	3.3	No of Monitoring Committee meetings	number	14	1	Not cumulative
F	3.4	Number of publicity events for beneficiaries	number	4	6	Not cumulative Contract Awarding Ceremony under the Second Call; Five project implementation trainings within the Second Call for Proposals in Bulgaria and Turkey; EC Day 2019 celebration; Regional consultation for the next programming period.
S	3.4	Number of publicity events for beneficiaries	number	4	5	Not cumulative
F	3.5	Number of employees (full time) whose salaries are co-financed by technical assistance	number	8	25	Not cumulative. 6 BG FL controllers, 6 persons staff of JS Haskovo, 4 persons staff of JS Edirne branch office and 9 MA experts.
S	3.5	Number of employees (full time) whose salaries are co-financed by technical assistance	number	8	25	Not cumulative. 6 BG FL controllers, 6 persons staff of JS Haskovo, 4 persons staff of JS Edirne branch office and 9 MA experts.

(1)	ID	Indicator	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
F	3.1	No of performed evaluations of the programme	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
S	3.1	No of performed evaluations of the programme	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
F	3.2	Updated MIS system	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.00	0.00
S	3.2	Updated MIS system	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.00	0.00
F	3.3	No of Monitoring Committee meetings	2.00	0.00	2.00	1.00	0.00
S	3.3	No of Monitoring Committee meetings	2.00	0.00	2.00	1.00	0.00
F	3.4	Number of publicity events for beneficiaries	6.00	9.00	4.00	11.00	0.00
S	3.4	Number of publicity events for beneficiaries	8.00	9.00	4.00	11.00	0.00
F	3.5	Number of employees (full time) whose salaries are co-financed by technical assistance	20.00	23.00	5.00	5.00	0.00
S	3.5	Number of employees (full time) whose salaries are co-financed by technical assistance	14.00	23.00	5.00	5.00	0.00

(1) S=Cumulative value - outputs to be delivered by selected operations [forecast provided by beneficiaries], F=Cumulative value - outputs delivered by operations [actual achievement]

3.3 Table 3: Information on the milestones and targets defined in the performance framework

Priority axis	Ind type	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Milestone for 2018 total	Final target (2023) total	2019	Observations
1	F	1	Eligible certified expenditure of the priority axis 1 "Environment"	EUR	821 171	13,339,303.00	3 624 932,53	Total certified amount (IPA + national funding)
1	I	1.1.1	Number of contracted projects related to risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	number	3	3.00	9	Signed contracts.
1	O	1.1.1	Number of interventions related to risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	number	0	3.00	8	Based on the projects contracted and their duration.
1	O	1.2.1	Number of nature protected areas addressed by interventions	number	3	5.00	12	Based on the projects contracted and their duration.
2	F	2	Eligible certified expenditure of the priority axis 2 "Sustainable tourism"	EUR	821 171	13,339,303.00	3 050 802,83	Total certified amount (IPA + national funding)
2	I	2.1.3	Number of contracted projects addressing OI 2.1.3 "Number of newly built / reconstructed facilities in / leading to touristic sites"	number	4	7.00	11	Signed contracts.
2	O	2.1.3	Number of newly built / reconstructed facilities in / leading to touristic sites	number	0	10.00	7	Based on the projects contracted and their duration.
2	O	2.2.1	Number of sustainable tourism strategies/action plans of common tourist destinations	number	2	3.00	5	Based on the projects contracted and their duration.

Priority axis	Ind type	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
1	F	1	Eligible certified expenditure of the priority axis 1 "Environment"	EUR	1,261,152.19	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
1	I	1.1.1	Number of contracted projects related to risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	number	6.00	6.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
1	O	1.1.1	Number of interventions related to risk prevention and management of natural and man-made hazards and disasters	number	2.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
1	O	1.2.1	Number of nature protected areas addressed by interventions	number	10.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
2	F	2	Eligible certified expenditure of the priority axis 2 "Sustainable tourism"	EUR	1,208,165.59	41,998.34	0.00	0.00	0.00

Priority axis	Ind type	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014
2	I	2.1.3	Number of contracted projects addressing OI 2.1.3 "Number of newly built / reconstructed facilities in / leading to touristic sites"	number	4.00	4.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
2	O	2.1.3	Number of newly built / reconstructed facilities in / leading to touristic sites	number	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
2	O	2.2.1	Number of sustainable tourism strategies/action plans of common tourist destinations	number	5.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00

3.4. Financial data

Table 4: Financial information at priority axis and programme level

As set out in Table 1 of Annex II to Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) No 1011/2014 (Model for transmission of financial data) and table 17 of model for cooperation programmes under IPA.

Priority axis	Calculation basis	Total funding (€)	Co-financing rate (%)	Total eligible cost of operations selected for support (€)	Proportion of the total allocation covered with selected operations (%)	Public eligible cost of operations selected for support (€)	Total eligible expenditure declared by beneficiaries to the managing authority (€)	Proportion of the total allocation covered by eligible expenditure declared by beneficiaries (%)	Number of operations selected
1	Total	13,339,303.00	85.00	10,098,912.47	75.71	10,098,912.47	4,530,313.92	33.96	33
2	Total	13,339,303.00	85.00	11,396,747.14	85.44	11,396,747.14	3,500,251.55	26.24	47
3	Total	2,964,290.00	85.00	2,283,477.00	77.03	2,283,477.00	933,390.84	31.49	10
Grand total		29,642,896.00	85.00	23,779,136.61	80.22	23,779,136.61	8,963,956.31	30.24	90

Where applicable, the use of any contribution from third countries participating in the cooperation programme should be provided (for example IPA and ENI, Norway, Switzerland)

N/A

Table 6: Cumulative cost of all or part of an operation implemented outside the Union part of the programme area

1. Operation (2)	2. The amount of IPA support(1) envisaged to be used for all or part of an operation implemented outside the Union part of the programme area based on selected operations	3. Share of the total financial allocation to all or part of an operation located outside the Union part of the programme area (%) (column 2/total amount allocated to the support from the IPA at programme level * 100)	4. Eligible expenditure of IPA support incurred in all or part of an operation implemented outside the Union part of the programme area declared by the beneficiary to the managing authority	5. Share of the total financial allocation to all or part of an operation located outside the Union part of the programme area (%) (column 4/total amount allocated to the support from the IPA at programme level *100)
	33 772,26	0,13 %	18 793, 77	0,07 %

(1) IPA support is the Commission decision on the respective cooperation programme.

(2) In accordance with and subject to ceilings set out Article 20 of Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013.

4. SYNTHESIS OF THE EVALUATIONS

According to the Programme Evaluation Plan (approved on 29.06.2016 by the JMC) the Implementation /mid-term evaluation of the Programme had been launched in June 2018. Tender procedure for Implementation evaluation under Interreg - IPA CBC Programmes, managed by the Republic of Bulgaria, had been completed and service contract with external consultant was signed on 28th of August 2018 with 7 months duration. The contract ended in March 2019 and the Implementation evaluation report of the Programme 2014-2020 has been prepared in accordance with the provisions of Art. 56 (3) of the Regulation (EU) № 1303/2013. The Report had been submitted and approved by MA and JMC (Decision No28 from 21.06.2019). The contractor provided feedback and recommendations for further improvement of the overall management and implementation of the current Programme progress, which could contribute towards successful achievement of Programme's objectives, results and outputs.

Name	Fund	From month	From year	To month	To year	Type of evaluation	Thematic priority	Topic	Findings
Implementation evaluation of Interreg - IPA CBC Programmes 2014-2020, managed by the Republic of Bulgaria	IPA(e)	8	2018	3	2019	Process	d, b	The overall objective of the evaluation of the implementation of the 3 (three) Interreg - IPA CBC Programmes 2014-2020, managed by the Republic of Bulgaria in terms of assessment of the current programme progress and providing recommendations for further improvement of the overall management and implementation of each of the programmes, which could contribute towards successful achievement of their objectives, results and outputs.	<p>- The approach used for project generation is to a great extent oriented towards the Programme objectives, results and outputs. The application package under the First Call for Proposals was well elaborated, and the GA were exhaustive in content. Full coherence with Programme objectives was ensured through the eligibility criteria and the cooperation criteria that project partners need to comply with. In terms of content, some weaknesses identified in the GA, relate to the lack of detailed information on output indicators and their measurement is observed, but during First call negotiation procedure, each of the Output indicators was discussed with the beneficiaries and details were provided on how the beneficiaries shall report the achievement of the respective indicator. All these deficiencies were addressed accordingly in the documentation of the Second Call for Proposals. Some issues with the criteria in the project evaluation grid and the complaint procedure under the First call were identified but those were generally resolved in the application package of the Second call. The Programme has some more specific elements as language barrier, very different administrative procedures from both side of the border, visa regime etc. which hampers the beneficiaries the projects application process and the implementation process.</p> <p>- The reporting and monitoring processes are structured in such a way as to ensure timely and realistic follow-up of Programme achievements. A smooth reporting process is underpinned by the detailed structure of progress reports and the relatively short deadlines for submitting them. In this way, the JS has high capability of capturing at an early stage various issues concerning achievement of planned project results. There are some weaknesses identified with regard to reporting the achievement of Output indicators, which is done just once, after completion of the project. If the achievement of an indicator is at risk, especially with regard to soft measures projects with shorter duration, timely corrective actions could be challenging. Regarding the online monitoring tools (Beneficiary Portal), beneficiaries, expressed high satisfaction.</p> <p>- The different supportive measures offered to beneficiaries regarding project implementation have been adequate, timely and complementary. The content of all Programme manuals, guideline documents, and</p>

									<p>training materials reflect to a significant extent the most frequently asked questions and issues raised by beneficiaries.</p> <p>- The Programme has a well elaborated indicator system, which allows provision of information for the achievement of results and outputs. Most indicators are measurable and time bound, with achievable target values for year 2023. Identified potential for improvement of the indicator system concerns mainly consistency of measurement units used, clear formulation, and simplification of definitions. In addition, the lack of a manual or methodological guidelines for measurement and calculation of output indicators puts at risk beneficiaries' understanding of indicators, as well as the accuracy and comparability of reporting. Most of the result indicators are based on non-compulsory surveys among stakeholders and the samples of the surveys are not unified. The measurement unit, base and target value could be streamlined. The value of the result indicators could be influenced by general economic and social factors and not only by activities and outputs financed by the Programme.</p> <p>- The Programme's progress toward achievement of the targets of the output and result indicators is quite good. The majority of the OIs under PA1 have good achievement progress and all of them except two are expected to be overachieved with the completion of the projects from the First Call for proposal. The two indicators which are lagging behind will be achieved with projects proposed for financing under the Second call for proposals.</p> <p>The OIs in the PA 2 also have satisfactory rates of achievement. Six of the OIs overachieved their values with the projects from the First call for proposals and two of them have reached achievement rates of over 60%. Only 4 of the OIs (namely the ones in SO 2.1.) have low achieved values. But their target values will be achieved with the projects proposed for financing under the Second call for proposals.</p> <p>There are 2 RIs in PA 1, one is fully achieved and the other is 94% achieved as of end of 2018. One RI under PA2 is significantly overachieved while the targets of the remaining two are achieved over 85%.</p> <p>The changed mechanism for selection of project proposals under the Second call has significant positive impact on the projected achievement of the OI of the Programme. All OIs below target will be achieved if the projects proposed for contracting in the Second call are implemented as</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---

										<p>planned. The savings from the First and Second Calls for proposals would allow contracting of the projects in the Reserve list of the Second call for proposals and this will contribute to the OIs values, especially in PA 2.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Overall results of the Second Call for Proposals show that not all allocated funds will be fully absorbed. A transfer of funds from PA 1 to PA 2, combined with generated savings from financial resources allocated under the First Call, would be the most appropriate solution. Therefore, an amendment of the Programme should be proposed, with reallocation of funds from PA 1 to PA 2. <p>With regard to the next programming period, there is identified possibility for changing the Programme implementation methods and use of combination of strategic projects and grants schemes for its implementation in order to reflect better the new challenges in the regional development sector. Potential for improvements are also recognised for the Programme indicator system. Main recommendations relate to the elaboration of methodological guidelines for the measurement and calculation of OIs, the simplification of definitions and fine-tuning of the measurement methodology for RIs.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Although the socio-economic situation on both sides of the border has improved since the start of the programme implementation, the development of the BG-TR cross-border region is still lagging behind other parts of the two countries, and the core challenges remain the same. The needs identified through the SWOT and Situation Analysis are still relevant to the current conditions in the area. - The observance of the horizontal principles is fully integrated in the management system of the Programme (application and implementation stages) and in the activities of the selected projects. Project proposals explicitly describe how the principles would be observed and the final project progress reports outline the practical implementation of the principles. - There is a high level of coherence between the goals of the Programme and the goals set in strategic documents at European, macro-regional, national and regional level. The activities carried out during the implementation of the Programme have high contribution towards the achievement of the priorities of the EU2020, Blue Growth Strategy, and a number of national and regional strategic documents. The degree of
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

									<p>contribution is directly linked to the achievement of the specific objectives of the Programme. The synergies between the Programme and the strategic documents are potentially high as the areas of intervention often correspond exactly.</p> <p>- The communication activities carried out by the Programme authorities ranged from regular publications on the website of the Programme, the social media accounts, information days, partner search forums, training seminars for beneficiaries and staff, up-to-date instructions, guidelines, manuals, adherence to requirements for visibility and dissemination of results for contracted projects, and annual implementation reports and the corresponding Citizens Summaries. The relevance of the activities to the general and specific objectives of the Communication strategy is generally good.</p> <p>It is recommendable for the next programming period, the objectives of the Communication Strategy to be reduced as number and presented in more consolidated way and the intervention logic to be presented more evidently. More detailed analysis and planning is necessary in setting the indicators target values. Coherence with the communication activities of the NA has to be strengthened and all communication activities to be included in the Programme Communication strategy.</p> <p>- The communication activities under the two calls were sufficiently tailored to the needs of the target groups of potential and actual beneficiaries and the general public. The information they provided to the groups and the means that information was delivered was adequately customized.</p> <p>- The combination of online communication tools and mainstream media was very successful in terms of increasing awareness of the Programme. The official Programme website was especially effective, as it was the most popular source of information about the Programme.</p> <p>In terms of attracting potential beneficiaries, the info days were the most effective communication tool. The social media tools also appear to be quite popular. It is recommended that the good practices established so far regarding the use of social media are further developed and enhanced.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---

										<p>- The methods for dissemination and capitalization of projects' and Programme results, are very adequate and effective. The website of the Programme could be re-arranged to put greater emphasis on the contracted projects. The websites of the projects could be used more actively to increase the sharing of project publications.</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

5. ISSUES AFFECTING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROGRAMME AND MEASURES TAKEN

(a) Issues which affect the performance of the programme and the measures taken

No significant problems that could have affected the Programme performance were identified during the reporting period.

(b) OPTIONAL FOR LIGHT REPORTS, otherwise it will be included in point 9.1. An assessment of whether progress made towards targets is sufficient to ensure their fulfilment, indicating any remedial actions taken or planned, where appropriate.

N/A

6. CITIZEN'S SUMMARY (Article 50(9) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

A citizen's summary of the contents of the annual and the final implementation reports shall be made public and uploaded as a separate file in the form of annex to the annual and the final implementation report

You can upload/find the Citizen's summary under General > Documents

7. REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF FINANCIAL INSTRUMENTS (ARTICLE 46 OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

8. PROGRESS IN PREPARATION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF MAJOR PROJECTS AND JOINT ACTION PLANS (ARTICLE 101(H) AND ARTICLE 111(3) OF REGULATION (EU) No 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(3)(B) OF REGULATION (EU) No 1299/2013)

8.1. Major projects

Table 7: Major projects

Project	CCI	Status of MP	Total investments	Total eligible costs	Planned notification/submission date	Date of tacit agreement/ approval by Commission	Planned start of implementation	Planned completion date	Priority axis / Thematic priorities	Current state of realisation — financial progress (% of expenditure certified to Commission compared to total eligible cost)	Current state of realisation — physical progress / Main implementation stage of the project	Main outputs	Date of signature of first works contract (1)	Observations
---------	-----	--------------	-------------------	----------------------	--------------------------------------	---	---------------------------------	-------------------------	-------------------------------------	--	---	--------------	---	--------------

(1) In the case of operations implemented under PPP structures the signing of the PPP contract between the public body and the private sector body (Article 102(3) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013).

Significant problems encountered in implementing major projects and measures taken to overcome them

--

Any change planned in the list of major projects in the cooperation programme

--

8.2. Joint action plans

Progress in the implementation of different stages of joint action plans

--

Table 8: Joint action plans (JAP)

Title of the JAP	CCI	Stage of implementation of JAP	Total eligible costs	Total public support	OP contribution to JAP	Priority axis	Type of JAP	[Planned] submission to the Commission	[Planned] start of implementation	[Planned] completion	Main outputs and results	Total eligible expenditure certified to the Commission	Observations
------------------	-----	--------------------------------	----------------------	----------------------	------------------------	---------------	-------------	--	-----------------------------------	----------------------	--------------------------	--	--------------

Significant problems encountered and measures taken to overcome them

--

9. ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 50(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013 AND ARTICLE 14(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013)

9.1 Information in Part A and achieving the objectives of the programme (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

Priority axis	1 - Environment
---------------	-----------------

--

Priority axis	2 - Sustainable tourism
---------------	-------------------------

--

Priority axis	3 - Technical assistance
---------------	--------------------------

--

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

9.2. Specific actions taken to promote equality between men and women and to promote non-discrimination, in particular accessibility for persons with disabilities, and the arrangements implemented to ensure the integration of the gender perspective in the cooperation programme and operations (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 and Article 14(4), subparagraph 2, (d) of Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013)

An assessment of the implementation of specific actions to take into account the principles set out in Article 7 of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 on promotion of equality between men and women and non-discrimination, including, where relevant, depending on the content and objectives of the cooperation programme, an overview of specific actions taken to promote equality between men and women and to promote non-discrimination, including accessibility for persons with disabilities, and the arrangements implemented to ensure the integration of the gender perspective in the cooperation programme and operations

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

9.3.Sustainable development (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 and Article 14(4), subparagraph 2, (e) of Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013)

An assessment of the implementation of actions to take into account the principles set out in Article 8 of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 on sustainable development, including, where relevant, depending on the content and objectives of the cooperation programme, an overview of the actions taken to promote sustainable development in accordance with that Article

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

9.4. Reporting on support used for climate change objectives (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

9.5 Role of partners in the implementation of the cooperation programme (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 and Article 14(4), subparagraph 1, (c) of Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013)

Assessment of the implementation of actions to take into account the role of partners referred to in Article 5 of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013, including involvement of the partners in the implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the cooperation programme

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

10. OBLIGATORY INFORMATION AND ASSESSMENT ACCORDING TO ARTICLE 14(4), SUBPARAGRAPH 1 (A) AND (B), OF REGULATION (EU) No 1299/2013

10.1 Progress in implementation of the evaluation plan and the follow-up given to the findings of evaluations

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

Status	Name	Fund	Year of finalizing evaluation	Type of evaluation	Thematic priority	Topic	Findings (in case of execution)	Follow up (in case of execution)
--------	------	------	-------------------------------	--------------------	-------------------	-------	---------------------------------	----------------------------------

10.2 The results of the information and publicity measures of the Funds carried out under the communication strategy

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

11. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION WHICH MAY BE ADDED DEPENDING ON THE CONTENT AND OBJECTIVES OF THE COOPERATION PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 14(4), SUBPARAGRAPH 2 (A), (B), (C) AND (F), OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1299/2013)

11.1. Progress in the implementation of the integrated approach to territorial development, including integrated territorial investments, sustainable urban development, and community led local development under the cooperation programme

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

11.2 Progress in implementation of actions to reinforce the capacity of authorities and beneficiaries to administer and to use the IPA

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

11.3 Contribution to macro-regional and sea basin strategies (where appropriate)

As stipulated by the Regulation (EU) No 1299/2013, recital 19, article 8(3)(d) on the "Content, adoption and amendment of cooperation programmes" and article 14(4) 2nd subparagraph (c) "Implementation reports", this programme contributes to MRS(s) and/or SBS:

Blue Growth Strategy is a long term strategy adopted by the European Commission in 2012 with main focus to support sustainable growth in the marine and maritime sectors as a whole. The objective of the Blue Growth strategy is to promote smart, sustainable and inclusive growth and employment opportunities in Europe's maritime economy. Both PA of the Programme has strong contribution to actions supported by the strategy. The Programme area covers parts of the Black sea area and supports partnership activities for preservation of marine and coastal environment (incl. litter reduction). PA 2 "Sustainable tourism" supports the development of coastal and maritime tourism. Some of the projects financed under the Second call for proposals will have direct contribution to the Strategy as the have activities addressing preservation of marine and coastal environment.

The Partnership Agreement between Bulgaria and the EU sets the frames of the assistance to be received from the EU structural and investment funds in the period 2014-2020. The Partnership agreement sets four priorities for the implementation of the EU Cohesion Policy. Also it exclusively states that the preferred priority areas for cooperation in the Programme between Bulgaria and the Turkey are in the field of environmental protection, promotion and development of natural and cultural heritage. Consequently, the Programme fully addresses these priority areas.

The Disaster Risk Reduction Strategy 2014 – 2020 for Bulgaria aims to outline a coherent framework for identification the strategic priorities for action to reduce the risk of disasters and to support the priorities measures implementation at national, district, municipal and field level. The strategy has 4 main priorities and PA 1 Environment is relevant to the last three priorities of the strategy.

The three NUTS III regions in Bulgaria that are covered by the Programme (Burgas, Yambol and Haskovo) have Regional Development Strategies for 2014 – 2020. In all of them the sustainable tourism development and the adaptation to the climate changes and protection of environment are defined as leading priorities. The CBC Programme supports exactly the same activities.

The Indicative Strategy Paper for Turkey (the Strategy Paper) sets out the priorities for EU financial assistance for the period 2014-20 to support Turkey on its path to accession. The Strategy paper sets the two main pillar for the pre-accession assistance in the period 2014 – 2020: "Democracy and rule of law" and "Competitiveness and growth". These two main pillar are further developed in seven priority sectors. The Programme contributes directly to the territorial and regional cooperation priority.

The Programme also provides strong contribution to the Environment, and climate action and energy sector. Turkey is located in one of the areas most vulnerable to climate change impacts. Therefore the projects funded under PA 1 Environment address these challenges.

Trakya Region Development Plan 2014 - 2023 focus at twenty-one priorities and ninety-four policies. PA 1 Environment contributes to the implementation of Initiative 10 related to protection of floods and earthquakes and PA 2 Sustainable Tourism supports Initiative 18 focused on development the tourism in Trakya region.

- EU Strategy for the Danube Region (EUSDR)
- EU Strategy for the Adriatic and Ionian Region (EUSAIR)

11.4 Progress in the implementation of actions in the field of social innovation

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

13. SMART, SUSTAINABLE AND INCLUSIVE GROWTH

Information and assessment of the programme contribution to achieving the Union strategy for smart, sustainable and inclusive growth.

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

14. ISSUES AFFECTING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROGRAMME AND MEASURES TAKEN — PERFORMANCE FRAMEWORK (ARTICLE 50(2) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

Where the assessment of progress made with regard to the milestones and targets set out in the performance framework demonstrates that certain milestones and targets have not been achieved, Member States should outline the underlying reasons for failure to achieve these milestones in the report of 2019 (for milestones) and in the final implementation report (for targets).

NOT TO BE REPORTED IN AIR FOR 2019

DOCUMENTS

Document title	Document type	Document date	Local reference	Commission reference	Files	Sent date	Sent By
----------------	---------------	---------------	-----------------	----------------------	-------	-----------	---------

LATEST VALIDATION RESULTS

Severity	Code	Message
----------	------	---------